Assimilating Mediating and Moderating Variables in Academic Research: Role and Significance

Fodouop Kouam Arthur William (Ph.D., corresponding author)

willyfodouop@163.com

https://orcid.org/0009-0009-3030-1094

School of Management, Hebei University

ZIP Code 071000, Baoding City, Hebei Province, China

+86-185-136-757-41

Abstract

This study explores the role and significance of mediating and moderating variables in academic research. Mediating and moderating variables are essential to understanding the complex relationships and mechanisms between concepts or phenomena. However, there is a lack of comprehensive integration of these variables in academic research, leading to biased or incomplete conclusions and hindering the progress of knowledge in various fields. This study addresses this gap by exploring the theoretical foundations, methodologies, challenges, and opportunities associated with incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research. The study's originality lies in its integrated approach, which examines mediating and moderating variables in the same research and highlights how these variables interact and influence each other in explaining relationships between different constructs. The findings from this study can enhance the rigor and reliability of research findings across various disciplines, leading to more effective strategies to address real-world challenges.

Keywords: Academic research; mediating variables; methodologies; moderating variables; statistical analysis

1. Introduction

In academic research, variables are crucial to understanding the relationships between concepts or phenomena. Mediating and moderating variables, mainly, are essential tools in helping researchers unravel complex relationships and mechanisms. Namazi and Namazi (2016) and Mackinnon (2011) both emphasize the importance of these variables in capturing the complexity of real-world problems and increasing the amount of information generated by outcome studies. Pokhariyal (2019) further underscores their significance, particularly in applied science studies. Pati (2020) extends this discussion to healthcare design studies, where the inclusion of these variables can optimize multifaceted solutions.

Mediating variables help understand the relationship between independent and dependent variables (Pokhariyal, 2019). They provide a more detailed understanding of these relationships, transmitting the effect of an antecedent variable onto a dependent variable (Mackinnon & Fairchild, 2009). Furthermore, analyzing mediating variables can help test specific hypotheses derived from theory, particularly in prevention and intervention research (Mackinnon, 1994). On the other hand, moderating variables influence the relationship between independent and dependent variables (Pokhariyal, 2019). They can clarify ambiguous results, extend theory, and signal field growth (Cunningham & Ahn, 2019). However, their testing and interpretation methods must be better understood (Dawson, 2014). In business research, they are used to identify causal relationships and are often studied using multi-group moderation through structural equation modeling (Vij & Farooq, 2017). Despite their significance, there needs to be a more comprehensive understanding and integration of these variables in academic research.

The failure to adequately incorporate mediating and moderating variables in research studies can lead to biased or incomplete conclusions. Rose et al. (2004) highlight the need for caution, as including these variables can introduce complexity and the potential for misinterpretation. This oversight can hinder the progress of knowledge in various fields and limit the applicability of research findings in practical settings.

Previous studies have highlighted the importance of mediating and moderating variables in academic research. However, many of these studies have focused on specific aspects or disciplines, leading to a fragmented understanding of their role and significance. Additionally, there is a lack of consistency in the terminology and methodology used to study these variables, further complicating their integration into research studies.

This study addresses the following research question: **How can mediating and moderating variables be effectively assimilated into academic research to enhance the quality and validity of research findings?** The objectives of the study are to:

Explore the theoretical foundations of mediating and moderating variables.
Examine the methodologies used to study and analyze these variables.
Identify the challenges and opportunities in academic research incorporating mediating and moderating variables.

This study aims to enhance the rigor and reliability of research findings across various disciplines by elucidating the role and significance of mediating and moderating variables in academic research. The findings of this study can help researchers better understand the complex relationships between variables and improve the validity and generalizability of their research outcomes.

The paper is organized as follows: The next section reviews the theoretical foundations of mediating and moderating variables. It is followed by a discussion of the methodologies used to study and analyze these variables. The subsequent section examines the challenges and opportunities in incorporating these variables in academic research. Finally, the paper concludes with recommendations for future research and implications for practice.

2. Theoretical foundations of mediating and moderating variables

In academic research, understanding the roles of mediating and moderating variables is crucial for enhancing the applicability and depth of research models. This section delves into the theoretical foundations of these variables, exploring their significance in clarifying relationships and providing insight into the mechanisms and conditional effects shaping those relationships. Through a thorough understanding of mediating and moderating variables, researchers can enhance the robustness and complexity of their analyses, leading to more meaningful research findings.

2.1. Mediating variables

Mediating variables are crucial in academic research, particularly business studies (Namazi & Namazi, 2016). They help to clarify complex relationships and enhance the applicability of models. Mediation is also a key concept in modern science, where it is used to address data heterogeneity and logical inconsistencies (Thanos, 2014). In research studies, mediating variables can be effectively utilized by understanding their roles and incorporating them into model equations (Pokhariyal, 2019). In psychological theory and research, mediating variables are used to transmit the effect of an independent variable on a dependent variable, and statistical methods to assess mediation are available (Mackinnon et al., 2019).

Mediating variables are intermediate factors that help to explain the underlying mechanisms or processes through which an independent variable influences a dependent variable. In other words, mediating variables provide insight into the "why" or "how" behind a particular relationship. For example, in a study examining the relationship between education level (independent variable) and income (dependent variable), job satisfaction could mediate how education level influences income through increased job opportunities or skills development.

2.2. Moderating variables

On the other hand, moderating variables influence the strength or direction of the relationship between an independent and dependent variable. Pokhariyal (2019) and Martín-Alcázar et al. (2020) both emphasize the significance of these variables in clarifying relationships and enhancing research models. However, Cunningham and Ahn (2019) point out that moderation in sports management research has not kept pace with the field's growth, highlighting the need for more rigorous testing. Hecht et al. (2022) present a method for efficiently exploring the causal role of contextual moderators in behavioral science, demonstrating the potential for further advancements in this area.

Moderating variables can help researchers determine under what conditions or for whom a particular relationship holds. For example, in a study investigating the impact of exercise (independent variable) on stress levels (dependent variable), age could serve as a moderating variable, with younger individuals experiencing a more substantial reduction in stress levels than older individuals.

2.3. Integration of mediating and moderating variables

While mediating and moderating variables serve distinct functions, they can also be integrated into research studies to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the relationships between variables. For example, a moderating variable could influence the strength of a mediated relationship, highlighting the complex interplay between different factors. This integration allows researchers to explore direct relationships between variables and the underlying mechanisms and conditional effects shaping those relationships.

Overall, a solid understanding of the theoretical foundations of mediating and moderating variables is essential for researchers to incorporate these variables into their studies effectively. By utilizing these variables appropriately, researchers can enhance the depth and complexity of their analyses, leading to more robust and meaningful research findings.

3. Methodologies used to study and analyze mediating and moderating variables

Studying mediating and moderating variables in academic research has evolved, with new methodologies and models being developed. Wen and Ye (2014) proposed a new procedure for analyzing mediating effects, which is more effective than the traditional causal steps approach. Vij and Farooq (2017) emphasized the importance of identifying moderating variables in business research and recommended using multi-group moderation through structural equation modeling. Namazi and Namazi (2016) expanded on the conceptual analysis of these variables, highlighting their significant impact on business research and the need for their inclusion in models. Dawson (2014) provided a comprehensive overview of moderation in management research, including testing and interpreting moderator effects in various model types. Mackinnon and Fairchild (2009) discussed current methods for investigating mediating variables. Mackinnon and Tofighi (2012) then provided a detailed overview of statistical and design methods for studying mediation relations.

Incorporating mediating and moderating variables into research studies requires careful consideration of the methodologies used to analyze these variables. Various approaches and techniques can be utilized to study and understand the role of mediating and moderating variables in the relationships between different constructs.

3.1. Mediation analysis

Mediation analysis, a vital tool in understanding complex relationships, has seen significant advancements in recent years (Miller et al., 2007). However, its application in partial least squares path modeling has been hindered by outdated methods (Nitzl et al., 2016). The field of psychology has seen a proliferation of perspectives on mediation analysis, each with its advantages and disadvantages (Agler & De Boeck, 2017). Mediation analysis is frequently used in communication research to assess causal relationships (Preacher& Hayes, 2008).

Mediation analysis involves testing how an independent variable influences a dependent variable via a mediator. It can be done using different statistical models such as Baron and Kenny's mediation model, Sobel test, and bootstrapping methods. Mediation analysis helps researchers determine variables' direct and indirect effects on each other, providing insights into the underlying processes driving relationships.

3.2. Moderation analysis

Moderation analysis, a critical academic research component, has been the subject of several studies. Memon et al. (2019) and Rasoolimanesh et al. (2021) both provide guidelines for conducting moderation analysis, with Memon et al. focusing on the identification, conceptualization, usage, analysis, and reporting of moderating variables, and Rasoolimanesh et al. proposing robust guidelines for hypothesis development, moderation assessment, and results interpretation.

Moderation analysis aims to explore how the relationship between an independent and dependent variable is influenced by a third variable (moderator). It can be done using techniques like interaction terms in regression analysis, hierarchical regression, and moderation models in structural equation modeling. Moderation analysis helps researchers identify boundary conditions under which a relationship may change, highlighting the contextual factors that influence the strength or direction of the relationship.

3.3. Combined mediation-moderation analysis

In some cases, researchers may need to analyze mediating and moderating variables in the same study. It can be achieved through techniques like moderated mediation analysis, which examines how the indirect effect of an independent variable on a dependent variable through a mediator is moderated by another variable.

Combined mediation-moderation analysis, as discussed by Edwards (2022), is a valuable tool for assessing conditional indirect effects. This approach is further refined by Edwards and Lambert (2007) through a general analytical framework that integrates moderated regression analysis and path analysis, providing a clearer understanding of the effects under investigation. Fairchild and Mackinnon (2014) emphasize the role of mediation and moderation analyses in refining interventions and program evaluation, particularly in demonstrating how and for whom programs work. Kristaung and Riorini (2020) extend this discussion to supply chain management marketing research, highlighting the importance of precise statistical tools in complex modeling. This integrated approach allows researchers to comprehensively understand the complex interplay between variables and their effects on outcomes.

3.4. Multilevel modeling

For studies involving hierarchical data or nested structures, multilevel modeling can be utilized to analyze mediating and moderating variables at different levels of analysis. Rockwood (2017) and Lachowicz et al. (2015) both highlight the importance of considering the hierarchical nature of data in these analyses, with Lachowicz explicitly discussing the use of multilevel structural equation modeling (MSEM) for fully and partially nested data. Krull and Mackinnon (1999, 2001) further demonstrate the utility of multilevel mediation modeling in group-based intervention studies, showing that it can lead to more accurate results than single-level procedures.

Multilevel modeling allows researchers to account for the nested nature of data and examine how variables operate at individual and group levels. Multilevel modeling can provide more nuanced insights into the relationships between variables in complex research settings.

By employing these methodologies and techniques, researchers can effectively study and analyze mediating and moderating variables in their research studies. These approaches help researchers uncover the underlying mechanisms, conditional effects, and interactive relationships between variables, contributing to a deeper understanding of the complexities of the phenomena under investigation.

4. Challenges and opportunities in incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research

Incorporating mediating and moderating variables can provide valuable insights into the complex relationships between variables. However, researchers often need help with statistical power, complex analysis techniques, and resource intensiveness. Despite these obstacles, utilizing these variables can lead to a more comprehensive understanding of phenomena and enhance the generalizability of research findings. This section will explore the challenges and opportunities associated with incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research.

Researchers face several challenges when incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research. Mackinnon (2011) and Namazi and Namazi (2016) highlight the complexity of identifying and including these variables. Mackinnon emphasizes the need for practical information and theory testing, and Namazi underscores their importance in capturing the nature of complex business problems. Mackinnon and Tofighi (2012) and Blum et al. (2020) further discuss the statistical and methodological issues, with Mackinnon focusing on the single mediator model and Blum et al. raising concerns about generalizing mediation techniques in high-dimension settings. Some of the significant difficulties researchers face when incorporating these variables into their research studies include:

4.1. Statistical power

Mediation and moderation analyses require larger sample sizes compared to traditional regression analyses. Thus, recruiting an adequate number of participants can prove difficult, and researchers must consider the complexity of their models, thereby minimizing the likelihood of overfitting.

4.2. Complex analysis techniques

Mediation and moderation analyses require specialized techniques that can be complex and challenging to apply. Researchers with limited statistical knowledge may need help utilizing these techniques, requiring them to employ technical statisticians to analyze their data.

4.3. Time and resource-intensive

Mediation and moderation analyses are often time and resource-intensive, requiring substantial expertise. They may require advanced software programs that can be costly, limiting some researchers' ability to perform these analyses.

Despite these challenges, mediating and moderating variables are crucial for comprehensively understanding the relationships between variables in academic research. Mackinnon (2011) emphasizes that these variables can provide practical information about interventions and test theories, thereby increasing the information generated from outcome studies. Namazi and Namazi (2016) extend this by highlighting that they can make the nature of complex business problems more transparent and complete and can help respond to questions about the relationship between independent and dependent variables. Pokhariyal (2019) further underscores the importance of these variables in research studies, particularly in terms of their roles and the need for effective utilization. Lastly, Vij and Farooq (2017) discuss the rationale for introducing moderating variables in business research and recommend using multi-group moderation through structural equation modeling. Further advantages include:

4.4. Comprehensive understanding

Mediating and moderating variables give researchers a deeper understanding of the mechanisms and processes underlying the relationships between different variables, often yielding better insights into the factors driving dependencies.

4.5. Richer and more complete models

Incorporating mediating and moderating variables allows researchers to develop more complete models of the phenomena they are studying, allowing them to account for contextual factors and shed light on the complex interplay between variables.

4.6. Increased generalizability

Mediation and moderation analyses can sometimes increase the generalization of research findings due to the more comprehensive nature of the analyses, leading to better estimates of effect sizes and more reliable research studies.

Incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research presents researchers with various benefits and challenges. Understanding these variables' theoretical foundations, employing appropriate methodologies, and overcoming statistical obstacles allow researchers to achieve a deeper and more accurate understanding of the phenomena they are studying.

5. Concluding remarks, recommendations for future research, and implications for practice

Incorporating mediating and moderating variables in academic research adds substantial value by providing a deeper understanding of the relationships between different constructs. Despite the challenges posed by the complexity of analysis techniques, the resource-intensive nature of the analyses, and the need for larger sample sizes, the benefits of studying mediating and moderating variables are evident.

Future research could address the identified challenges and explore new methodologies to overcome them. Advancements in statistical techniques, the development of user-friendly software, and collaborations between researchers and statisticians can facilitate the incorporation of mediating and moderating variables in research studies.

Moreover, future research could also explore the intersection between mediating and moderating variables, examining how these two variables interact and influence each other in explaining relationships between different constructs. This integrated approach could lead to a more comprehensive understanding of the underlying processes and contextual factors that shape the relationships between variables.

Implications for practice stemming from research on mediating and moderating variables are significant. Besides, understanding how independent variables impact dependent variables via mediators can inform intervention strategies to target specific pathways to achieve desired outcomes. Similarly, recognizing the moderating effects of certain variables can help practitioners tailor interventions to individual or contextual characteristics, enhancing their efficacy.

Practitioners and policymakers can benefit from research on mediating and moderating variables by gaining insights into the nuances of relationships between variables, allowing them to make informed decisions and design tailored interventions. By incorporating findings from studies that consider mediating and moderating variables, practitioners can develop more effective strategies that address the underlying processes driving outcomes and account for contextual factors that influence these relationships.

In sum, the study and analysis of mediating and moderating variables provide researchers with valuable insights into the complexities of relationships between variables. Future research endeavors should overcome challenges, explore new methodologies, and integrate findings to enhance the understanding of these variables' roles in academic research and their implications for practice. By harnessing the knowledge generated by studying mediating and moderating variables, researchers and practitioners can advance their understanding of complex phenomena and develop more effective strategies to address real-world challenges.

References
Agler, R.A., & De Boeck, P. (2017). On the Interpretation and Use of Mediation: Multiple Perspectives on Mediation Analysis. *Frontiers in Psychology, 8*.
Blum, M.G., Valeri, L., François, O., Cadiou, S., Siroux, V., Lepeule, J., & Slama, R. (2020). Challenges Raised by Mediation Analysis in a High-Dimension Setting. *Environmental Health Perspectives, 128*.
Cunningham, G.B., & Ahn, N.Y. (2019). Moderation in sport management research: room for growth. *Measurement in Physical Education and Exercise Science, 23*, 301 - 313.
Dawson, J.F. (2014). Moderation in Management Research: What, Why, When, and How. *Journal of Business and Psychology, 29*, 1-19.
Edwards, J.R., & Lambert, L.S. (2007). Methods for integrating moderation and mediation: a general analytical framework using moderated path analysis. *Psychological methods, 12 1*, 1-22.

Edwards, K.D. (2022). Practical Assessment, Research, and Evaluation Practical Assessment, Research, and Evaluation Moderated Mediation Analysis: A Review and Application to Moderated Mediation Analysis: A Review and Application to School Climate Research School Climate Research.

Fairchild, A.J., & Mackinnon, D.P. (2014). Using Mediation and Moderation Analyses to Enhance Prevention Research.

Hecht, C.A., Dweck, C.S., Murphy, M.C., Kroeper, K.M., & Yeager, D.S. (2022). Efficiently exploring the causal role of contextual moderators in behavioral science. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 120*.

Kristaung, R., & Riorini, S.V. (2020). Mediation-Moderation Modeling for Marketing in Supply Chain Management. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management, 9*, 996-1006.

Krull, J.L., & Mackinnon, D.P. (1999). Multilevel Mediation Modeling in Group-Based Intervention Studies. *Evaluation Review, 23*, 418 - 444.

Krull, J.L., & Mackinnon, D.P. (2001). Multilevel Modeling of Individual and Group Level Mediated Effects. *Multivariate Behavioral Research, 36*, 249 - 277.

Lachowicz, M., Sterba, S.K., & Preacher, K.J. (2015). Investigating multilevel mediation with fully or partially nested data. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 18*, 274 - 289.

Mackinnon, D.P. (1994). Analysis of mediating variables in prevention and intervention research. *NIDA research monograph, 139*, 127-53.

Mackinnon, D.P. (2011). Integrating Mediators and Moderators in Research Design. *Research on Social Work Practice, 21*, 675 - 681.

Mackinnon, D.P., & Fairchild, A.J. (2009). Current Directions in Mediation Analysis. *Current Directions in Psychological Science, 18*, 16 - 20.

Mackinnon, D.P., & Tofighi, D. (2012). Statistical Mediation Analysis.

Mackinnon, D.P., Fairchild, A.J., & Fritz, M.S. (2019). Mediation analysis. *Annual review of psychology, 58*, 593-614.

Martín-Alcázar, F., Ruiz-Martínez, M., & Sánchez-Gardey, G. (2020). Deepening the Consequences of Multidisciplinarity on Research: The Moderating Role of Social Capital. *Minerva*, 1-25.

Memon, M.A., Cheah, J., Ramayah, T., Ting, H., Chuah, F., & Cham, T.H. (2019). MODERATION ANALYSIS: ISSUES AND GUIDELINES. *Journal of Applied Structural Equation Modeling*.

Miller, T.L., Triana, M.D., Reutzel, C.R., & Certo, S.T. (2007). Mediation in Strategic Management Research: Conceptual Beginnings, Current Application, and Future Recommendations. *Research Methodology in Strategy and Management, 4*, 295-318.

Namazi, M., & Namazi, N.R. (2016). Conceptual Analysis of Moderator and Mediator Variables in Business Research. *Procedia. Economics and finance, 36*, 540-554.

Nitzl, C., Roldán, J.L., & Cepeda, G. (2016). Mediation Analysis in Partial Least Squares Path Modeling: Helping Researchers Discuss More Sophisticated Models. *PSN: Econometrics*.

Pati, D. (2020). Improving Precision and Confidence of Research Application Through Mediator and Moderator Models. *HERD: Health Environments Research & Design Journal, 13*, 12 - 20.

Pokhariyal, G.P. (2019). Importance of moderating and intervening variables on the relationship between independent and dependent variables.

Preacher, K.J., & Hayes, A.F. (2008). Contemporary approaches to assessing mediation in communication research.

Rasoolimanesh, S.M., Wang, M., Mikulić, J., & Kunasekaran, P. (2021). A critical review of moderation analysis in tourism and hospitality research toward robust guidelines. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*.

Rockwood, N.J. (2017). Advancing the Formulation and Testing of Multilevel Mediation and Moderated Mediation Models.

Rose, B.M., Holmbeck, G.N., Coakley, R., & Franks, E.A. (2004). Mediator and Moderator Effects in Developmental and Behavioral Pediatric Research. *Journal of Developmental & Behavioral Pediatrics, 25*, 58-67.

Thanos, C. (2014). Mediation: The Technological Foundation of Modern Science. *Data Sci. J., 13*, 88-105.

Vij, S., & Farooq, R. (2017). Moderating Variables in Business Research.

Wen, Z., & Ye, B. (2014). Analyses of Mediating Effects: The Development of Methods and Models.